LEMIRE JOHNSON, LLC

Attorneys at Law

2534 Route 9, P.O. Box 2485, Malta, NY 12020 518.899.5700 ~ 518.793.9005 Fax 518.899.5487 www.lemirejohnsonlaw.com

December 6, 2011

VIA Facsimile Only

Hon. Cathy Seibel, USDCJ USDC - Southern District of New York Federal Building and U.S. Courthouse 300 Quarropas Street White Plains, New York 10601

Re: Ahmad v. E. Ramapo Central S.D., et al. Civil Case No.: 7:-09-cv-01440 (CS-PED)

Dear Honorable Judge Seibel:

We write on behalf of Defendant, the East Ramapo Central School District ("ERCSD"), to briefly respond to Plaintiff's Rule 72 Objections to Magistrate Davison's rulings of November 8, 2011 (Dkt. No. 151).

The objections Plaintiff advances with respect to the issues enumerated as "1", "2", "3", "4", and "5"do not relate directly to our client. With respect to those issues, the ERCSD respectfully submits that Plaintiff has been afforded an extraordinary amount of time to conduct party and non-party discovery at great expense, and Judge Davison's limitations on Plaintiff's additional discovery pursuits are reasonable, appropriate and necessary.

With respect to Plaintiff's request for an "investigation" of what Plaintiff claims he heard on a courtflow recording (Item No. 6), Plaintiff offers no legal or factual basis for his non-specific investigation request of this non-issue. As an initial matter, Attorney Lemire has informed me that Plaintiff's interpretation of his confidential remark is not accurate and moreover, by e-mail dated November 10, 2011, Mr. Lemire warned Plaintiff against misrepresenting his confidential remark to our client. To the extent the Court wishes to indulge Plaintiff's hypothetical accusation, I can safely represent that no attorney of this office has or will attempt to edit any courtflow audio recordings even assuming arguendo such a thing was possible.

Finally, with respect to the opportunity a non-party witnesses to access review or sign deposition transcripts, it my understanding that Plaintiff previously agreed to access these transcripts at his expense from the stenographer prior to November 8, 2011. Thereafter, on November 8, 2011, Plaintiff attempted to change this arrangement and shift new costs to our clients which Judge Davison properly rejected and informed Plaintiff that he would need to bear the cost of obtaining deposition transcripts just like any other party. Apart from the pro

LEMIRE JOHNSON, LLC

Ahmad v. ERCSD, et al. 04 Civ. 1440 (CS/PED)

December 6, 2011

Page 2

se Plaintiff's attempts to "represent" non-parties, this issue has been fully and properly disposed of by Judge Davison.

Thank you in advance for your consideration.

Respectfully yours,

LEMIRE JOHNSON, LLC

Bar Roll No. GJ3348

gti@lemirejohnsonlaw.com

GTJ:ek

cc: Lewis R. Silverman, Esq. at <u>lrs@rutherfordchristie.com</u> (via Electronic Mail Only)
Mushtaq Ahmad at <u>NYmushtaq@aol.com</u> (via Electronic & 1st Class Mail)

LEMIRE JOHNSON, LLC

Attorneys at Law

2534 Route 9, P.O. Box 2485, Malta, NY 12020 518.899.5700 ~ 518.793.9005 Fax 518.899.5487

FAX TRANSMITTAL COVER SHEET

DATE:

December 6, 2011

PLEASE DELIVER THE FORTHCOMING PAGES TO:

ATTN:

Hon. Cathy Seibel, U.S.D.C.J.

FROM:

Gregg T. Johnson (GJ3348)

RE:

Mushtaq Ahmad v. East Ramapo Central School District, et al.

Civil Case No.: 09 Civ. 1440

FAX NUMBER:

914-390-4278

NUMBER OF PAGES TO FOLLOW COVER SHEET:

2

IF YOU DO NOT RECEIVE ALL PAGES, PLEASE CALL (518) 899-5700 AND ASK FOR THE OPERATOR. THANK YOU.

COMMENTS/SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS:

This correspondence is simultaneously being emailed to Plaintiff and co-defense counsel; and a copy will also be sent to Plaintiff via 1st class mail.

<u>CONFIDENTIALITY NOTE</u>: The information contained in this facsimile message is legally privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copy of this telecopy is strictly prohibited. If you have received this telecopy in error please immediately notify the operator by telephone and return the original message to us at the address above via the United States Postal Service. Thank you.